# **ATTACHMENT 1**

Date: April 24, 2017

Re: RFP for City-wide Pavement Management Plan

**Evaluation Result Summary** 

	Consultant			
Evaluator	NCE	Bucknam	GIE	
Mark Uphus	196.00	193.00	169.00	
Nick Hsieh	189.50	176.50	159.50	
AJ Holmon	165.00	158.50	164.00	
LINE TOTAL	550.50	528.00	492.50	

Difference from NCE:

(22.50)

(58.00)

Consultant: <u>Bucknam Infrastructure Group</u> Date: <u>4-12-17</u>

Project: <u>City-wide Pavement Management Program</u>

CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROPOSAL PRESENTATION				
<ul> <li>Organization and Completeness</li> </ul>	1.5	9	13.5 15	
o Initiative & Creativity	1.5	10	15	
QUALIFICATIONS				
<ul> <li>Experience of the firm on similar engagements/projects</li> </ul>	2.5	10	25	
<ul> <li>Qualifications &amp; Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)</li> </ul>	2.0	10	20	
WORK PLAN			-	
<ul> <li>Knowledge and understanding</li> <li>of the Project</li> </ul>	2.5	10	25	
<ul><li>Availability</li></ul>	1.5	9	13.5	
Project Budgeting and Cost Control	2.0	9	18	
o QA/QC	1.5	10	15	
REFERENCES				
<ul> <li>Work quality provided to the reference(s)</li> </ul>	2.5	10	25	·
o Customer service experience	2.5	9	22.5	
GRAND TOTAL	20.0		193	

Evaluator: Mark Uphus Signature:

Consultant:	G.I.E.	_ Date: _	4-12-17
Project:	City-wide Pavement Management	<u>Program</u>	

CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROPOSAL PRESENTATION				
	1.5	8	12	
<ul> <li>Organization and Completeness</li> </ul>			9	
o Initiative & Creativity	1.5	6	,	
QUALIFICATIONS				
Experience of the firm on similar engagements/projects	2.5	10	25 20	
<ul> <li>Qualifications &amp; Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)</li> </ul>	2.0	10	20	
WORK PLAN				
<ul> <li>Knowledge and understanding of the Project</li> </ul>	2.5	9	22.5	
o Availability	1.5	9	13.5	
<ul> <li>Project Budgeting and Cost Control</li> </ul>	2.0	8	10	
o QA/QC	1.5	9	13.5	
REFERENCES	**************************************			
<ul> <li>Work quality provided to the reference(s)</li> </ul>	2.5	7	17.5	
o Customer service experience	2.5	8	20	
GRAND TOTAL	20.0		169	

Evaluator: Mark Uphus Signature:

Consultant:	N.C.E.	Date:	4-10-17

Project: <u>City-wide Pavement Management Program</u>

	CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROI	POSAL PRESENTATION				
0	Organization and Completeness	1.5	9.5	14.25	
0	Initiative & Creativity	1.5	9	13.5	
QUAI	LIFICATIONS				
0	Experience of the firm on similar engagements/projects	2.5	ID	25	·
0	Qualifications & Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)	2.0	10	20	
WOR	K PLAN				
0	Knowledge and understanding of the Project	2.5	10	25	
0	Availability	1.5	10	15	
0	Project Budgeting and Cost Control	2.0	9	18	
0	QA/QC	1.5	10	15	
REFEI	RENCES				
0	Work quality provided to the reference(s)	2.5	ID	25	
0	Customer service experience	2.5	10	25	
	GRAND TOTAL	20.0		196	·

Evaluator: Mark Uphus Signature: Mark Uphus

Consultant: Bucknam Infrastructure Group Date: 4/12/17

Project: <u>City-wide Pavement Management Program</u>

	CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROI	POSAL PRESENTATION				
-0	Organization and Completeness	1.5	8	13	
0	Initiative & Creativity	1.5	9	13.5	
QUA	LIFICATIONS				-
0	Experience of the firm on similar engagements/projects	2.5	10	22	
0	Qualifications & Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)	2.0	3	18	
WOR	K PLAN				
0	Knowledge and understanding of the Project	2.5	10	25	
0	Availability	1.5	10	15	
0	Project Budgeting and Cost Control	2.0	8	16	
	QA/QC	1.5	8	12	
REFE	RENCES				
0	Work quality provided to the reference(s)	2.5	8	၃၀	
0	Customer service experience	2.5	రో	30	
	GRAND TOTAL	20.0		176.5	

Evaluator: Nich Hsich Signature: MA	Evaluator: <u>N.J.</u>	Hsieh	_ Signature:	MA
-------------------------------------	------------------------	-------	--------------	----

Consultant:	G.I.E.	Date: 4/12/17
Project:	City-wide Pavement Managem	nent Program

	CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROP	POSAL PRESENTATION				
0	Organization and Completeness	1.5	8	12	
0	Initiative & Creativity	1.5	8	12	
QUAL	IFICATIONS				
0	Experience of the firm on similar	2.5	8	၃၀	
0	engagements/projects  Qualifications & Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)	2.0	9	18	
WOD	V DI AN				
• •	K PLAN  Knowledge and understanding of the Project	2.5	10	10.5	
	Availability	1.5	7	10.5	
. 0	Project Budgeting and Cost Control	2.0	7	14	
0	QA/QC	1.5	7	10.5	
REFER	RENCES				
0	Work quality provided to the reference(s)	2.5	8	<u>a</u> 0	
0	Customer service experience	2.5	7	17.5	
	GRAND TOTAL	20.0		159.5	

	Wich High	Signature: MA
Evaluator:	14.0, 1-2/-	Signature: _*VV\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\

Consultant:_	N.C.E.	Date:	4/12/17

Project: <u>City-wide Pavement Management Program</u>

CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROPOSAL PRESENTATION			-	
<ul> <li>Organization and Completeness</li> </ul>	1.5	10	12	
<ul> <li>Initiative &amp; Creativity</li> </ul>	1.5	10	15	
QUALIFICATIONS				
Experience of the firm on similar	2.5	10	92	
engagements/projects  O Qualifications & Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)	2.0	9	18	
WORK PLAN				
<ul> <li>Knowledge and understanding of the Project</li> </ul>	2.5	10	32	
o Availability	1.5	9	13.5	
<ul> <li>Project Budgeting and Cost Control</li> </ul>	2.0	9	18	
o QA/QC	1.5	10	15	
REFERENCES				
<ul> <li>Work quality provided to the reference(s)</li> </ul>	2.5	9	95.2	
Customer service experience	2.5	٩	33.2	
GRAND TOTAL	20.0		189.5	

	OND.
Evaluator: Nich Hsieh	Signature:

Consultant Bucknam Infrastructure Group Date: 4-17-17

Project: <u>City-wide Pavement Management Program</u>

CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROPOSAL PRESENTATION				
o Organization and Completeness	1.5	8	12	
o Initiative & Creativity	1.5	7	10,5	
QUALIFICATIONS				
<ul> <li>Experience of the firm on similar engagements/projects</li> </ul>	2.5	8	20	
<ul> <li>Qualifications &amp; Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)</li> </ul>	2.0	9	18	
WORK PLAN				
<ul> <li>Knowledge and understanding of the Project</li> </ul>	2.5	8	20	
o Availability	1.5	9	13,5	
<ul> <li>Project Budgeting and Cost Control</li> </ul>	2.0	8	16	,
o QA/QC	1.5	9	13.5	
REFERENCES				
<ul> <li>Work quality provided to the reference(s)</li> </ul>	2.5	7	17,5	
Customer service experience	2.5	7	17,5	
GRAND TOTAL	20.0		158.50	

Evaluator: A 5 Holmon II Signature: Allt mon

Consultant_	G.I.E.	Date:
Proiect:	City-wide Pavement Manager	ment Program

CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROPOSAL PRESENTATION				
o Organization and Completeness	1.5	8	12	
o Initiative & Creativity	1.5	7	12	
QUALIFICATIONS				
Experience of the firm on similar	2.5	9	22.5	
engagements/projects  O Qualifications & Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)	2.0	9	18	
WORK PLAN			SALARY A	
<ul> <li>Knowledge and understanding of the Project</li> </ul>	2.5	10	25	
o Availability	1.5	7	10,5	
<ul> <li>Project Budgeting and Cost Control</li> </ul>	2.0	9	18	
o QA/QC	1.5	7	10,5	
REFERENCES				
<ul> <li>Work quality provided to the reference(s)</li> </ul>	2.5	7	17,5	
o Customer service experience	2.5	J	20	
GRAND TOTAL	20.0		20	

Evaluator: A.S. Holmow Signature: All Common Signature:

Consultant	N.C.E.	Date:
Project:	City-wide Pavement Ma	anagement Program

	CRITERION	(a) Weight	(b) Score (0-10)	(a) x (b) Weighted Score	Remarks
PROI	POSAL PRESENTATION				
0	Organization and Completeness	1.5	8	12	·
0	Initiative & Creativity	1.5	7	10.5	
QUAI	LIFICATIONS				
0	Experience of the firm on similar engagements/projects	2.5	9	22.5	
0	Qualifications & Experience of Personnel (PM and Staff)	2.0	9	18	
WOR	K PLAN				
0	Knowledge and understanding of the Project	2.5	10	25	
0	Availability	1.5	9	13.5	
0	Project Budgeting and Cost Control	2.0	9	18	
0	QA/QC	1.5	7	10.5	
REFE	RENCES				
0	Work quality provided to the reference(s)	2.5	7	17.5	
0	Customer service experience	2.5	7	17.5	
	GRAND TOTAL	20.0		165	

Evaluator: AS Holmon Signature: Allomovi